

**RALEIGH TRANSIT AUTHORITY  
MARCH 8, 2012  
MINUTES**

The Raleigh Transit Authority met on Thursday, March 8, 2012 at 3:30 p.m. in the City Council Chamber, Raleigh Municipal Building, 222 W. Hargett Street with the following present:

Chairman Joseph Springer, presiding  
Corey Branch  
Stacey Carless  
Gerry Cohen  
Roger Kosak  
Regina Price  
Craig Ralph  
Les Seitz  
Jane Thurman  
Uel Whitsett

Staff present: David Eatman, Mike Kennon, Scott McClellan

City Council Liaison: Councillor Baldwin

Chairman Springer called the meeting to order with discussion and actions taken as shown:

**AGENDA – APPROVED AS AMENDED**

Mr. Eatman indicated if time permits, he would provide an overview of the ART Program status, budget outlook and an update on the contractor's service. This item would be added as an information item. Without objection, the agenda was approved as amended.

**MINUTES – FEBRUARY 9, 2012 – APPROVED AS AMENDED**

Members received in their packets a copy of the February 9, 2012 minutes. Mr. Kosak noted the minutes referred to him as chair of the Route Committee which should be corrected. Mr. Ralph moved approval of the minutes as amended. His motion was seconded by Mr. Branch, unanimously passed. Chairman Springer ruled the motion adopted.

**ART ON THE MOVE – APPROVED**

Kim Curry-Evans, Public Art Coordinator, was present to request permission to begin planning the next "Art on the Move" project. She presented slides from the three previous projects. The first of the series was in 2007 and involves an 18 month cycle.

Twelve buses will be covered by 12 artists' artworks for a 6 month period. Artist selection is very competitive and artists must be at least 18 years old and live and work in Wake County. Last year over 50 competed. There has been interest in a collaborative effort with students. Ms. Curry-Evans indicated the Arts Commission also worked with the Transit Operations Center in displaying the artworks originally displayed on the busses within that facility. The goal is to start with a Call for Artists in the fall and busses would be ready for next year's Artspllosure in May. The wraps would be on the busses from May until Thanksgiving. Mr. Ralph asked who owns the designs once selected for the busses with Ms. Curry-Evans responding she would be happy to review that for future discussion with the Authority.

Mr. Seitz asked if more than 12 busses could be wrapped with Mr. Eatman responding the Authority recently increased the ability to advertise on more vehicles and with the addition of these 12 we would be falling into 60%-70% of the system with advertisements or artworks. He felt the use of 12 busses works well.

Mr. Kosak moved approval for the next Art on the Move Project. His motion was seconded by Mr. Branch, unanimously passed. Chairman Springer ruled the motion adopted.

#### **EARTH DAY – FARE FREE DAY – APRIL 21, 2012 APPROVED**

Mr. Eatman reported staff requests a Fare Free Day on Saturday, April 21, 2012 in observance of Earth Day. The average Saturday revenue in 2011 was \$4,344.31. He explained this is an excellent marketing opportunity if it gets someone to try CAT. Transit will have a booth at this event located near the museum. Mr. Ralph indicated Transit is sharing a booth with Triangle Transit which also allows sharing managing the booth. He noted Triangle Transit does not participate in the free rides. Mr. Ralph felt this is something worthwhile and should be approved. Mr. Eatman noted the marketing budget will be used for press releases, media ads and placards for all busses.

Mr. Seitz moved approval of the Fare Free Day on Earth Day, Saturday, April 21, 2012. His motion was seconded by Mr. Ralph, unanimously passed. Chairman Springer ruled the motion adopted.

#### **RTA POLICY HANDBOOK – APPROVED**

Mr. Eatman explained three months ago, all current policies of the Authority were forwarded to the appropriate committees in an effort to update them and discard those which are no longer relevant. The Marketing Committee met in February and made recommendations on their assigned policies. Those policies that did not require any edits and require reaffirmation were provided to members in the packet. In addition, policies that have been edited according the staff/committee recommendations were provided for the Authority's approval. Policies requested for approval were the Bus Color and Logo Policy, Bus Advertising Policy, Citizen Requests Policy, Route and Schedule Brochures

Availability Policy, Identification Sign Policy and Rider Notification Policy. Following approval by the Authority, the policies will be included in the Policy Manual.

Ms. Thurman moved approval of the policies as recommended by the Marketing Committee. Her motion was seconded by Mr. Ralph, unanimously passed. Chairman Springer ruled the motion adopted.

#### **REQUEST FOR SERVICE, WORTHDALE NEIGHBORHOOD ASSOCIATION – REFERRED TO THE ROUTE COMMITTEE**

Mr. Eatman explained the Worthdale Neighborhood Association requested by formal letter an extension to Route 18 Worthdale. Members received a copy of the letter in their agenda packets. He recommended that the item be referred to the Route Committee.

Mr. Seitz moved referral of this item to the Route Committee. His motion was seconded by Mr. Ralph, unanimously passed. Chairman Springer ruled the motion adopted.

Mr. Ralph requested that staff advise the neighborhood association when the Route Committee will meet to discuss this item.

#### **ACCESSIBLE RALEIGH TRANSPORTATION (ART) – ALTERNATIVES ANALYSIS – RECEIVED AS INFORMATION**

Mr. Eatman noted the ART Program is a very large element of what Transit does every day. Individual taxis and contractors provide up to 1500 passenger trips per day. The history of the program was reviewed. The service area is defined by  $\frac{3}{4}$  mile buffer around existing route transit services. The ART service area mirrors fixed route geographical coverage and hours of service with a fare of \$2.00 per one way trip. Mr. Eatman stated the program continues to grow at an astonishing rate. An overview of the system was discussed. FY 2011 fully allocated annual cost was \$8,365,966; FY 2011 Cost/Trip was \$20.46 and there were 408,834 trips in FY 2011. There are 400+ calls received each weekday and 1,500+ trip bookings/weekday. He reviewed how much passenger trips per fiscal year have increased between FY 2002 and FY 2011 as well as the number projected for FY 2012. Annual cost has grown at a rate of \$1 million annually. Cost per trip was reviewed from FY 2002 until the present noting we went to an automatic system in 2008. He reported staff feels costs per trip have reached a plateau and hoped they go down when shared ride opportunities are introduced. He explained we are required to provide curb to curb transportation and many clients actually receive door to door transportation which is not sustainable from a shared ride basis. Mr. Eatman indicated it is a change for those being moved to the new system. Mr. Eatman reviewed minimum required ADA Service standards. Existing service delivery was reviewed that included:

- 43 individual taxi companies utilized
- Clients are assigned to a company – many companies assign clients to individual drivers
- Many companies provide door-to-door or through door service
- Due to the current service delivery practices clients have developed relationships with individual drivers and companies
- Annual program growth is projected to continue

Mr. Eatman noted the senior population is growing as well and could not say trip demand will decrease but we need to be smart on how we move forward and wants to continue finding cost savings.

Mr. Kosak indicated Raleigh has a hybrid system being implemented and would appear this would probably be the most economic system in the context that most municipalities are using nothing but vans and we can economize by dispatching taxis at times. Mr. Kosak noted Mr. Eatman designed this and the way the software is set up, it would be assumed the cost will come into line. He agreed the number of trips will continue to grow.

#### **STAFF REPORTS – RECEIVED**

Members received in their agenda packets the following staff reports:

1. Statement of Income and Loss (December/January 2012)
2. Operating Statistics (December/January 2012)
3. Evaluation by Route (December/January 2012)
4. Productivity by Route (December/January 2012)
5. Variance Analysis (December/January 2012)
6. Go PASS Ridership Summary
7. Go PASS Ridership by Agency
8. Accessible Raleigh Transportation Summary (December/January 2012)

Mr. Eatman noted the system has grown 18-20% and the ART program has grown between 9% and 12% annually. He noted growth is not a bad thing but is not sustainable under the current format so a way must be developed to move forward with the system. He indicated this is a growing area and did not expect ridership to decrease.

The reports were received as information.

#### **PUBLIC COMMENTS – RECEIVED**

Graham Oliver discussed various businesses that provide gas discounts with purchase of groceries, etc. He suggested the possibility of transferring those discounts towards bus passes. Mr. Eatman indicated staff would check into this and provide the information to Mr. Oliver.

Lillian Jones indicated she is a local artist and has done a local “Raleigh Treasure Hunt” for several years. She reviewed how the treasure hunt works and stated there is one coming up. She requested approval for using the RLine in the treasure hunt. The treasure hunt takes several months to solve. She reported the Arts Commission is very supportive of this project as well as local businesses. This is a non-profit activity but not a registered 501C3 project noting she pays the money for the project. Ms. Jones explained permission from the Authority is needed in order to place the images in the bus. The beginning of the project is at the beginning of the equinox and lasts 1-3 months. Mr. Eatman indicated Ms Jones has been in touch with staff and felt this is an interesting idea and felt it could get people to ride the RLine and supported the request from that concept. He noted RLine does have a charge for advertising space within the bus. Mr. Eatman noted the Authority may desire to refer this to the Marketing Committee to review quickly. Mr. Seitz expressed concern that this would be setting a precedent since it is not a non-profit.

Ms. Thurman moved referral of the request to the Marketing Committee for discussion on March 15. Her motion a seconded by Mr. Branch, unanimously passed. Chairman Springer ruled the motion adopted. The Authority discussed the time schedule for the project and agreed the Marketing Committee would have the authority to make a decision on this item and advise the Authority at their next meeting.

#### **CAT SHORT RANGE TRANSIT PLAN – REPORT RECEIVED – STAFF AUTHORIZED TO MOVE FORWARD WITH PUBLIC REVIEW PROCESS**

Robert Bush, HDR Engineering, Inc. explained the Capital Area Transit Short Range Transit Plan was recently completed and members had received a copy prior to the meeting. This looked at upcoming FY 2013, 2014, 2015 and 2016. He reviewed overall themes noting the purpose is to the most we can with available funds we have today. Models and assumptions have been made about the following year. He noted an aggressive marketing program is recommended. Mr. Bush reviewed changes recommended to begin July 1, 2012 for the July 4 holiday. He reviewed the proposed holiday services in detail. Two categories of holiday service are recommended. The Saturday holiday schedule for next year would occur the Friday after Thanksgiving, Christmas Eve, New Year’s Eve and MLK Day. He explained the second category is Sunday holiday service which would be July 4, Labor Day, New Year’s Day and Memorial Day for next year. The net effect of this would be a wash. Mr. Bush reviewed other suggested changes noting there would be some riders who lose service because there are not that many riders on those particular stretches of roadway. He reviewed changes to #1 Capital Boulevard. Every route will be kept running from 6:00 a.m. until 7:00 p.m. Routes were pointed out on maps available at the meeting that would be lost (26, 27 and 28 are ones affected). This is a result of reviewing where the actual riders were located. Route 22 will run earlier in the morning due to high ridership. Evening changes occurring after 7:00 p.m. were reviewed and pointed out on the map. Saturday service changes were reviewed including adding one on #1 Capital Boulevard and #15

WakeMed on Saturdays that will provide much better overall quality of service for these riders.

Mr. Eatman requested that the Authority approve releasing this information to the public for comments.

Mr. Seitz questioned if it is obvious service will be cut to a particular route, will those riders be notified with Mr. Eatman responding that can be done.

Discussion followed relating the #23C going away with Mr. Bush indicated this is a cross town route and large portions of that area will have service to Downtown. If the City Council votes to increase the amount of money available, all this can be kept.

Sunday services were reviewed and pointed out. New Sunday service will be #2 Falls of Neuse to Millbrook; #4 Rex Hospital; #5 Biltmore, #7 South Saunders and #15 WakeMed.

Mr. Bush used maps available at the meeting to show the 2012 Changes.

Mr. Bush explained proposed 2013 changes in detail noting in January, 2013 there are changes recommended in the southeast area to beef up frequency to WakeMed during mid day. Major service additions and restructuring proposed for Chavis Heights Service were reviewed. Mr. Kosak indicated in 2008 when he came to the Authority, the Authority wanted to fix this problem. In February a letter was sent to the Council requesting additional funding to fix problems like those mentioned. He indicated #15 WakeMed needs to be upgraded. Mr. Kosak indicated revenues have increased from sales tax in the City of Raleigh because Raleigh grew and bus ridership has also grown noting there was an 11% increase this year. He felt the Authority should request additional funding to fix this problem once and for all. Mr. Kosak emphasized there are 3 routes that have been in trouble since he came on the Authority (Capital Blvd., WakeMed, Falls of Neuse) and it is not like this is a new problem.

At this point Mr. Bush reviewed proposed 2015 changes that involve changes in #15 WakeMed and #15c Trawick Road. Mr. Kosak indicated if the ½ cent sales tax is approved, it will be a long time before any major adjustments can be made. He felt if the Authority is going to do some changes, it will have to be done out of the Authority's funds to start with.

Mr. Eatman explained from 2014 forward in the Short Range Transit Plan, those services align with defined services in the 2040 Plan or the first 5 years of the Wake County Transit Plan. If the sales tax increase is approved, we are full speed ahead on the plans. Mr. Bush stated it is assumed the sales tax would be available by 2014. Mr. Cohen stated if the referendum is this fall, the revenues could be available as early as July 1, 2013. If the referendum is pushed back 1 year, revenues would be available July 2014.



Mr. Ralph noted many people feel this Wake County Transit Plan is more rail and explained it is not just rail and is more bus. Councillor Baldwin indicated Mr. Cook and Mr. King have indicated the first phases of the plan is for busses and commuter rail with light rail being the second phase which is something we cannot afford right now. She explained they have tried to be clear phase 1 can be afforded just with sales tax. She reviewed the status of the referendum noting the Wake County Commissioners have not voted to move this forward. Councillor Baldwin indicated Mr. Cook is seeding interlocal agreements with other municipalities noting Raleigh is not alone in expressing its opinion we need to move forward with this. She indicated Mr. King has done a good job of presenting a plan that is practical in telling people this is what we can afford over the next 10 years. Mr. Ralph indicated we are getting beaten up by the rail portion. Councillor Baldwin indicated right now we do need bus services and commuter rail. She referred to \$4 per gallon gas which will cause a spike in bus ridership which increases the need for bus and commuter rail service. The question is how we service all these people noting it will be a nightmare if nothing is done. She felt this is the new reality and the fact is until we get alternate energy sources, there is no control over our destiny. Councillor Baldwin indicated some Commissioner has asked for the latest polling data which will be in May and there could be a total change in polling data if gas prices continue to increase. Mr. Cohen noted he had heard "don't ask until May 9."

Mr. Kosak stated in context of adding additional services on some routes today means you cannot use the sales tax to pay for that route in the future. Councillor Baldwin stated she had asked that question many times and there has been no clear cut answer. Mr. Kosak stated he would like to get a few of these problems with the busses taken care noting the people riding buses are clearly dependent on the busses. Mr. Kosak stated this is a big city and his concern is a couple of the problems could be fixed today. Councillor Baldwin indicated the last 2 budget years have been rough noting Raleigh is very well managed. She stated the Council has not been able to expand services or address needs like they would like. The first budget hearing will be held at the end of March and the Council will have a better idea of where we are at that time. Discussion has taken place relating to adding money to the bus system but there has been no money to do that and did not know if there will be any opportunity in this upcoming budget to do that. The transit system will be a priority if there is extra money in the budget

Mr. Ralph spoke to the need to be creative and determine if there are things that can be done to reduce costs for RLine. Mr. Seitz noted RLine was put there at the behest of the business people. Mr. Kosak indicated he could see no reason why meals and hotel room taxes can't be used for the RLine. Councillor Baldwin responded the lack of money is one reason and this has to be agreed upon by the Wake County Commissioners and the City Council and did not think that is going to be an expenditure the Commissioners will agree upon. She stressed there is a very limited pot of money and after the needs are covered, there is not much left in the pot. Councillor Baldwin noted she has a recurring meeting conflict with the Authority's meetings but advised members to contact her if she is ever needed to attend a meeting.

Mr. Bush continued with his presentation by reviewing proposals for 2014-2016. He reviewed required funding for each year noting the total capital cost from 2013-2016 is \$80 million. Mr. Bush stated there is a lot going on currently and the end result will far outweigh turmoil caused by changes.

Mr. Eatman indicated from staff's perspective, he would request permission to present this to the TAC and get the word out to the public. He noted this would include a press release, inclusion of proposals on the website. An opportunity would also be provided for people to respond on email. There would be 2 primary meetings – Downtown and one in North Raleigh as well as various workshops. He also suggested sending route changes to the Route Committee and start relaying information and receive comments and come back to the Authority with an update of efforts in April with a public hearing scheduled in May. That would provide 60 days to get a majority of the comments. Depending on the public hearing, it could be determined whether July is a feasible date to start the changes. He noted it will not be easy for staff to do this. Mr. Eatman indicated staff is looking at implementation in the summer noting staff will assume that many of these elements would be changing. He explained it will not cost a great deal to start planning except staff costs noting every sign will have to be inventoried, etc. Mr. Bush noted the reason July was the start date is to take care of the July 4 holiday. He indicated it would be nice to get the structure in place before school begins.

Mr. Ralph moved that staff be authorized to move forward with public review and comments relating to the FY 2013 route changes as presented. His motion was seconded by Mr. Branch, unanimously passed. Chairman Springer ruled the motion adopted.

#### **FINANCE COMMITTEE – NO REPORT**

The agenda noted the Finance Committee did not meet since the last regularly scheduled meeting. The No Smoking at Moore Square Station Policy is pending in committee and waiting for the City Attorney's review.

#### **MARKETING COMMITTEE – REPORT**

Ms. Thurman indicated the Marketing Committee met on February 15, 2012 and discussed Bus Shelter Advertising and CAT Website Information. Both items are being held in committee for further study.

#### **ROUTE COMMITTEE – REPORT**

Chairman Springer appointed Craig Ralph as chair of the Route Committee.

Mr. Ralph encouraged all Authority members to attend the Route Committee meetings when the changes as outlined in the Short Range Transit Plan are discussed.



### **AUTHORITY MEMBER REMARKS – RECEIVED**

Mr. Seitz referred to comments made earlier in the meeting relating to the City Council giving the Authority more money. He indicated Transit needs more resources but the money is not there. He challenged Authority members to sit through the entire Council budget process and listen to the hardships noting it is a very humbling experience. He noted it is a big picture involved. Mr. Seitz urged members to do what they can to inform themselves of the bigger picture.

Ms. Thurman indicated Councillor Baldwin is on the board of the Downtown Raleigh Alliance and stated she would like to see business leaders brought into the dialogue noting \$700,000 per year is spent on RLine. She stated we need to determine a way to get revenues for that service.

Mr. Ralph urged everyone to campaign for the Transit Plan noting rail is not the only component.

Mr. Kosak referred to his earlier comment relating to the use of the hotel and meals tax revenues.

Mr. Branch indicated this was a good meeting and staff had done an excellent job.

Ms. Carless indicated she was excited about 2014.

Chairman Springer indicated there was interesting discussion at this meeting and thanked staff for their excellent work.

### **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:40 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Brenda Hunt

Raleigh Transit Authority  
March 8, 2012